# CHARTER SCHOOLS IN FRESNO

## A STUDY BY THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF FRESNO



### EDUCATION COMMITTEE LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF FRESNO

KAY BERTKEN, CHAIR

JACQUIE CANFIELD
FRANCINE FARBER
SUE GOLDMAN
JANET RYAN
AMY SCHMIDT
TRUDI THOM
MARSHA WAGNER
LENORE YOUSEF
NYLA ZENDER



#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Beginning with the school year 2016-2017, the Education Committee prioritized the study of the charter schools located in the Fresno Unified School District. We relied heavily on the California Department of Education's data bases and also sent teams of two members to tour most of the schools and interview administrators, teachers and students.

The charter schools in Fresno Unified represent a range of structures: virtual schools, independent study, seat-based and blends; independent schools or branches of larger networks; schools that are chartered by Fresno Unified or by the County or by other districts; schools that have a single campus and schools that operate "resource centers" in addition to their chartered campus.

The study examines a number of critical areas and includes observations and data about the following:

- Structure
- Numbers
- Demographics
- Curriculum
- Achievement
- Success Markers
- Finances
- Trends

A number of concerns were noted. Among these were insufficient transparency and accountability, significantly low achievement in a number of instances, financial data that did not yield compete information, and state regulations that appear not to be uniformly enforced. These concerns led to recommendations which are here summarized:

- 1. Charter schools need to include transparent financial and achievement data on their web sites
- 2. Their Boards of Education need to follow the Brown Act so that information such as agendas and minutes is readily available to the public
- 3. Charter schools should list all their locations and not just the originally chartered site
- 4. Schools featuring independent study need to strengthen their curriculum and make greater efforts to motivate students to stay in school and graduate
- 5. The chartering district should enforce state regulations regarding standards and oversight and assure that stated goals are met

#### **CHARTER SCHOOLS IN FRESNO**

#### A Study by the Education Committee of the League of Women Voters of Fresno

#### Introduction

In February 2017 League members selected Education as one of their three local priorities for study for the year. The presence in Washington of a new Education Secretary, her support for charters and vouchers, as well as the need for more information on this subject, led the committee to focus its study on charter schools.

Charter schools have been part of the Fresno educational landscape since 1994, when the West Park School opened for independent study in grades 9 through 12. Over the years charter schools have opened and closed in Fresno. It is estimated that 200 to 300 charter schools close in the United States annually.

Our investigation began with meetings with the Fresno Unified School District administrator in charge of charter authorization, oversight and renewal. We also interviewed and heard from local charter school advocates. Our own research involved data from the California Department of Education (CDE). For consistency, we relied on the CDE data from 2016-2017, the latest year available for many of the statistics. We have augmented that with enrollment trend information from 2017-2018 in the Trend section of the report. We also noted the change in status that involved some of the schools in 2017-2018 in that section.

A list of charter schools in Fresno and basic information about them was researched by members of the League's Education Committee. A questionnaire was developed and teams of two committee members signed up to visit two to four schools each, using the questionnaire as a guideline during their visits. Although it was not possible to get exactly the same information about each school, there was a great deal of common information obtained through which to make comparisons. We did not visit the charter schools that do not have a local campus or office. We also did not visit Morris E. Dailey or University High because of previous visits, local publicity and meetings at Fresno Unified concerning those schools. None of our committee members was personally connected to any of the charter schools in our study.

In our interviews and data gathering, we were interested in learning about the programs the schools offered, their successes and perceived weaknesses, their accountability to the public, and the ways in which these schools might be serving the students of Fresno as alternatives to the public schools.

This report covers the seventeen schools with official charter numbers given out by the CDE. While some of these schools operate affiliated satellite campuses or resource centers, unless those have separate charter numbers, the numbered campus data includes their information. This fact may inflate enrollments at a particular school campus and may not appropriately recognize alternative performance measures for each site.

#### **STRUCTURE**

The charter schools operating within the boundaries of Fresno Unified School District represent a range of structures: virtual schools vs. independent study vs. seat-based or blends; independent schools vs. branches of larger networks of charters; schools that are chartered by the home district, Fresno Unified, vs. schools chartered by the Fresno County Schools Office (FCOE) or other districts; schools that have a single campus vs. schools that operate "resource centers" in addition to their chartered campus.

#### **Charter Schools within Fresno Unified Boundaries after 2017**

SCHOOL	AUTHORIZER	INSTRUCTION	MULTIPLE AREA SITES	NETWORK
Ambassdor Phillip Sanchez	Raisin City Elem.	Independent Study(9-12)	yes	Learn4Life
Aspen Public	FUSD	Seat-based(K-3)	yes	Aspen Public Schools
Aspen Valley Prep	FUSD	Seat-based(K-8)	yes	Aspen Public Schools
Big Picture Academy	Fresno COE	Seat-based(K-12)	yes	Big Picture Learning
California Virtual Academy	Orange Center	Virtual/Independent Study(K-8)	no	Calif. Virtual Academies
Carter Woodson	FUSD	Blend(7-12)	yes	Agape
Compass Charter Schools of Fresno	Orange Center	Virtual/Independent Study(K-12)	no	Compass Charter Schools
Crescent View South	Westside Elem.	Independent Study(9-12)	yes	Learn4Life
Crescent View West	Fresno COE	Independent Study(7-12)	yes	Learn4Life
Edison-Bethune	Fresno COE	Seat-based(K-6)	no	
Kepler	FUSD	Seat-based(TK-8)	no	
Morris E. Dailey	FUSD	Seat Based (K-5)	no	
School of Unlimited Learning (SOUL)	FUSD	Blend(9-12)	no	
Sierra	FUSD	Independent Study(K-12)	no	
University High	FUSD	Seat-based(9-12)	no	
W.E.B. Dubois	Washington USD	Seat-based(K-12)	no	Agape
West Park	Westpark Elem.	Independent Study(9-12)	yes	

- At least two virtual schools operate in Fresno. These schools do not have a physical campus locally. They
  provide instruction online. The California Virtual Academy centered in Simi Valley serves K-8. The
  Academy of Arts and Sciences, an affiliate of Compass Charter Schools, operates out of West Lake
  Village, California (alternatively listed as Thousand Oaks) and serves K-12 students. It provides both a
  virtual independent study program and a home school support program. Both virtual schools are
  chartered by Orange Center Elementary School District, a one-elementary school district located just
  south of Fresno.
- Five schools operate independent study programs. Students in these schools receive some instruction and materials from teachers at a school, then work on packets of material on their own time. They generally spend a few hours one to two times a week with teachers at the school for assistance, review, and testing on the materials. Ambassador Phillip Sanchez, Crescent View South and Crescent View West, Sierra and West Park are all independent study programs. Sierra is the only one of these that serves elementary age students. The rest serve 9-12<sup>th</sup> grade although Crescent View West has a small middle school component. Sierra is the only one authorized by the Fresno Unified School District; one is authorized by the Fresno County Office of Education; the other three are authorized by elementary school districts that each serve one elementary school.

- Eleven schools serve high school-aged students; five of those serve only grades 9-12. Only three of the eleven are seat-based programs; just one is a seat-based only high school program, University High. The rest are independent study or blends or offer virtual online instruction.
- Seat-based programs offer traditional classroom instruction in a full-time school setting. Eight out of the 17 charters operating in Fresno offer traditional seat-based programs though they serve slightly less than half of charter students.
- A few schools provide a blend of seat-based and independent study. These include Carter Woodson (grades 7-12), the School of Unlimited Learning (SOUL) serving grades 9-12, and Crescent View West's relatively small middle school program. A new school that was just chartered as of January 2018—The California Academy of Sports Science Fresno, headquartered in Ontario and chartered by Raisin City proposes to provide a combination program.
- State and national networks of charter schools have affiliated campuses among those in Fresno. They
  include Compass Charter Schools, California Virtual Academies (CVA), Agape (Carter Woodson and
  W.E.B. DuBois), Learn4Life (Crescent View West and South and Ambassador Phillip Sanchez), Big Picture
  Learning, and Aspen Public Schools.
- Some schools have expanded by opening secondary sites or "resource centers," making it difficult to learn the exact number of charter schools operating in the area. Crescent View South and West and Phillip Sanchez all operate or have operated secondary sites under their primary charters. No separate data is kept for these centers by the state. Big Picture has two addresses but only one charter number as does Carter Woodson. Aspen operates two schools with two different charters. Aspen Valley Preparatory is sometimes listed as Valley Preparatory with the State.
- Only eight of the schools in Fresno Unified's boundaries are chartered by the Fresno Unified School
  District. Three are chartered by the Fresno County Office of Education. Six are chartered by other
  school districts: Orange Center Elementary, Raisin City Elementary, Westside Elementary, Westpark
  Elementary and Washington Unified School Districts.

#### **NUMBERS**

There are approximately 37 charter schools in Fresno County including the 17 individually chartered programs operating within the boundaries of Fresno Unified. More than 7,000 students attend the Fresno Unified area charter schools—enough students to more than fill three elementary schools, one middle and almost two comprehensive high schools. They receive more than \$65 million dollars in state funding (as of 2016-2017), representing a large investment in children and resources. The schools vary in enrollments; the seat-based programs average around 325 students, the independent study programs range from a couple of hundred to nearly a thousand students. (Table of enrollments follows on next page.)

- The smallest school, Aspen Public (AKA Aspen Meadow), serves 74 students in a K-3 expansion site.
- The largest is Crescent View West which serves nearly 1,000 mostly at-risk youth in middle and high school grades in an independent study program.

• The California Virtual Academy serves more than 400 students in Fresno, while the Compass virtual school counts a little more than 100.

**Charter School Enrollments 2016-2017\*** 

School	2016-17 Enrollment					
Ambassador Phillip Sanchez	421					
Aspen Public (K-3)	74					
Aspen Valley Prep(K-8)	363					
Big Picture	355					
Calif. Virtual Academy	414					
Carter-Woodson	352					
Compass Fresno	118					
Crescent View South	681					
Crescent View West	927					
Edison-Bethune	576					
Kepler	386					
Morris E. Dailey	389					
Sierra	409					
SOUL	184					
University High	474					
W.E.B.Dubois	353					
West Park	262					
Total enrollment	7314					
FUSD	73356					
FUSD minus FUSD charters	70725					

<sup>\*2017-2018</sup> enrollments are included for comparisons in the Trend section of this report.

#### **DEMOGRAPHICS**

#### **Ethnicity**

The Fresno charters vary in their ethnic makeup, but many resemble the population of Fresno Unified students who are about 67% Hispanic and 10% each of African American, white and students of Asian descent. Overall though, white students are over-represented and Asians are under-represented in the charters.

#### **Enrollments of Major Ethnic Groups**

SCHOOL	%Hispanic	%African-Am	%Asian	%"White"
Fresno Unified	67.80%	8.50%	10.60%	10%
CHARTERS:				
Ambassador Phillip Sanchez	73.9%	10.2%	3.8%	7.6%
Aspen Public	66.2%	14.9%	4.1%	8.1%
Aspen Valley Prep	61.4%	9.4%	5.2%	20.1%
Big Picture	57.5%	5.1%	0.6%	14.4%
California Virtual Academy	35.7%	10.1%	1.4%	41.3%
Carter Woodson	70.5%	13.6%	3.7%	8.8%
Compass Fresno	44.9%	5.1%	2.5%	34.7%
Crescent View South	58.6%	7.2%	2.1%	24.1%
Crescent View West	74.4%	5.2%	2.0%	13.8%
Edison-Bethune	66.5%	27.8%	3.8%	1.2%
Kepler	43.8%	6.2%	0.8%	43.0%
Morris E. Dailey	50.1%	5.1%	4.4%	32.9%
SOUL	77.2%	8.2%	3.3%	8.2%
Sierra	64.1%	3.9%	2.7%	24.0%
University High	24.1%	1.7%	21.1%	34.2%
W.E.B. DuBois	77.3%	15.9%	1.7%	2.8%
West Park	79.0%	3.8%	0%	13.0%

- The demographics of these charter schools are highly variable with significant outliers among the schools.
- The average % Hispanics in independent-study or blend charters is 72% and 55% among seat-based schools.
- African Americans represent an average of 7.7% in independent or blend schools and 10.5% of seat-based schools.
- Whites represent 13.4% on average in independent or blend schools and 24.4% in the seat-based schools.
- An average of 5.5% of seat based and 2.2% of independent study or blend sites are Asian students.

Two of the very high achieving district charters --Dailey Elementary and University High--are particularly unrepresentative of the district student population, perhaps what one charter school advocate suggested as an unintended consequence of success—the attraction of motivated white parents. The white population of these two schools is much larger than the district's—about a third of the students in each.

Dailey chooses its students by lottery when applicants exceed the available space. It gives preference to siblings. University High, which has a music emphasis, requires students to have at least two years of music experience and to present their transcripts. It has been criticized for "exclusionary" admission policies by the ACLU (<u>Fresno Bee</u> August 5, 2016) and, upon its most recent charter renewal (2016), by the Fresno Unified Board of Trustees.

#### **Special Populations**

Nearly 10% of students served by Fresno Unified receive special education services, and 21.6% are English Learners. As of 2016-2017 statistics, 87.4% of the students fall into the state's unduplicated count of English Learners, foster and homeless youth, or children living in poverty.

The charter schools generally underrepresent both the English learner and special education populations. Even though charter schools are required to serve all students, their special education services are less comprehensive than the regular public schools, and some contract with Special Education Local Plan Areas (SELPA's) to provide those services: Fresno Unified (Woodson, SOUL, Dailey and Kepler); Fresno County Office of Education (University High, Edison-Bethune and Big Picture); and El Dorado County, a SELPA that provides special education support to charter schools all over the state (Aspen Meadow Aspen Valley Prep, Sierra, Ambassador Phillip Sanchez, Crescent View South, Crescent View West, and Compass Charter Schools of Fresno). One charter school acknowledged that there probably were more special education students than were identified.

The unduplicated counts of high need students vary from far below in a few schools to above the levels in the district. This count includes the proportion of English Learners, foster youth, homeless and students living in poverty. This count forms the basis for augmented funding from the State under its Local Control Funding Formula (LCFF).

**2016-2017 Special Population Percentages of Enrollments** 

Charter School	% ENGLISH LEARNER	% SPECIAL ED.	UNDUPLICATED COUNT %	
Ambassador Phillip Sanchez	17.1%	7.6%	91.4%	
Aspen Public	18.9%	2.7%	93.2%	
Aspen Valley Prep	9.1%	6.9%	78.9%	
Big Picture	15.2%	2.8%	70.7%	
CA. Virtual Academy	3.9%	15.2%	67.7%	
Carter Woodson	11.4%	6.8%	98.4%	
Compass Fresno	2.5%	3.4%	53.6%	
Crescent View South	5.7%	9.4%	82.4%	
Crescent View West	11.8%	6.7%	90.1%	
Edison-Bethune	25.0%	6.6%	94.2%	
Kepler	4.1%	8.6%	58.3%	
Morris E. Dailey	6.7%	1.5%	37.5%	
SOUL	19.0%	10.8%	93.8%	
Sierra	4.6%	13.4%	77.9%	
University High	0.0%	0.6%	10.5%	
W.E.B. DuBois	31.7%	6.5%	99.3%	
West Park	22.9%	7.6%	86.1%	
FUSD (without its charters)	21.6%	9.8%	87.4%	

SCHOOL SETTING	% African American	% Asian	% Hispanic	% White	% English Learner	% Special Education	% Unduplicated Count
Fresno Unified	10%	10%	67%	10%	22%	10%	87%
Charter School Averages	9%	4%	60%	19.5%	12%	7%	75.5%
Seat-Based	12%	3%*	60%	17%	14%	5%	68%
Independent-Study	6%	2%	66%	19%	12%	9%	86%
Blended programs	11%	3.5%	74%	8.5%	15%	9%	96%
Virtual/Independent Study	8%	2%	20%	38%	3%	9%	61%
* excludes outlier University High with 21.2% Asian students							

- English Learners represent an average of 14% of seat-based schools and 12% of independent study schools and a very small proportion of virtual school students.
- On average, Special Education students represent 5% of seat based and 9% of independent study and virtual schools.
- Unduplicated count percentages are below FUSD counts at the two virtual schools (54%, and 68%) and at Kepler, a seat-based program (58%), and far below at two high-performing seat-based schools, University High and Dailey Elementary (38% and 10.5%) compared with the district at 87%.
- The independent study and blended schools tend to have unduplicated counts at least as high as the District as do seat-based schools located in high poverty areas of the city.
- The unduplicated percentage at the charters is correlated with achievement scores. Low achievement scores in math and ELA are associated with the schools with relatively high unduplicated counts and vice versa (ELA r= (-.89) Math r= (-.80)).

#### **CURRICULUM**

There are as many approaches to curriculum as there are schools, fulfilling one of the ambitions for charters—that they provide alternatives. Approaches differ between the seat-based and online sites. The independent study sites generally require students to attend at least one day a week.

#### **Seat based**

- Dailey is an International Baccalaureate campus with a demanding and accelerated curriculum promoted by the IB requirements.
- Several schools depend on computerized instruction: Edison Bethune and Aspen Valley use Chromebook for instruction. The latter utilizes the Summit Learning program in grades 4-6.
- Aspen Valley Prep's students each are assigned to a teacher-mentor whom they meet with once a week for ten weeks.
- Kepler's program is built around service learning. Annually the students take the Urban Plunge, staying overnight at the Fresno Rescue Mission and providing services to the clients there.
- Big Picture stresses art and science which they use to teach language arts and other subjects.

- Big Picture High School requires students to spend four days a week in class with internship placements
  on Wednesdays. There is no standard curriculum. Some students take foreign language classes at City
  College. Each student is required to produce a quarterly exhibition, usually a multimedia presentation
  demonstrating what they have been learning.
- Some schools provide school psychology and speech services; some contract with the Fresno County schools for those and/or other special education services.
- University High School, located on the CSUF campus, has admission requirements based on music background. The curriculum is rigorous college preparatory with a music requirement.

#### **Independent study**

- Most independent study programs serve students who are behind in skill levels and, at the high school level, behind in credits.
- The School of Unlimited Learning (SOUL) uses credit recovery packets from the Plato computer program while the Economic Opportunities Commission (its sponsor through FUSD) provides workforce training and experiences.
- Crescent View West, Crescent View South and Ambassador Phillip Sanchez students (Learn4Life programs) meet one to two times a week with a lead teacher and subject teachers who review work packets that the students do on their own time at the school or at home. They can recover two credits per week by completing these packets, allowing them to finish up to 1.5 years of high school credits in one year.
- Crescent View West has staffed tutorial rooms for math and science and English. They also require
  classroom instructed short courses in college readiness, computer literacy and soft work skills. A
  special education teacher, speech therapist and psychologist are on staff (possibly shared across
  Learn4Life campuses) Fresno City College instructors teach entrepreneurship. Art and sports are
  available to all the Learn4Life campuses.
- Crescent View West has a middle school component for around 75 students. Those students attend
  more structured seat-based classes, each with two teachers for four days a week for 3.5 hours each
  day. The program emphasizes individualized instruction.
- Many Carter Woodson students enter reading at a 4<sup>th</sup> grade level. Literacy and reading fluency are stressed. Career pathways available include business management education, medical assistant and cosmetology. The middle school component is seat-based while most high school students are on independent study.
- Sierra uses Google classroom and Chrome for curriculum development and assignments. Students
  are expected to be on site for two days each week and may come as frequently as four days for
  math support. Students must pass with a C to move forward. Each course is equivalent to 10
  credits.
- DuBois serves students who have been out of school for a year and are habitual truants. They offer
  career pathways including education, business, patient care, energy, ag business, and
  entrepreneurship. Internships of 60 hours are available, for which students get a stipend.

#### **Virtual Schools**

 The Compass Charter Schools of Fresno provides a home-school support program and a virtual/independent study program offering online courses. The online program uses StrongMind Curriculum for grades 6-12 and K12 Curriculum for kindergarten through 5<sup>th</sup>. Its homeschool program

- subcontracts (indirectly through parents) with various vendors that provide enrichment programs, including one at The Learning Village, a program operating out of buildings at a Fresno church.
- The California Virtual Academy operates what the CDE calls an independent study program for its students. While the program offers class meetings online with teachers, some students are reported to get mostly online power point presentations.

#### **ACHIEVEMENT**

Student achievement, as measured by the California Smarter Balanced Assessments in English language arts (ELA) and mathematics and reported by the California Department of Education in the latest available data (2016-2017), represented considerable variation. Levels of proficiency at the charters was correlated with the unduplicated counts of high need youth (ELA r= (-.89) Math r= (-.80)). Proficiency was especially low at the independent study high schools which generally serve students who have experienced difficulty in the mainstream schools.

Fresno Unified's scores vary considerably across schools as well. Overall in the district, 31% of students met or exceeded grade level standards on ELA tests given in grades three through eight and grade eleven. In math the percentage was lower at 22%. In general, the scores at the charters were lower than in the district with some notable exceptions. Five schools outperformed the district in ELA while eight did worse and three about the same. In math, four exceeded the proportion of students in the district who met or exceeded standards and twelve did worse. The following table shows the percent of students in the charter schools that met or exceeded proficiency on the state standards.

**2016-2017 ELA and Math Proficiency Percentages** 

SCHOOL	ELA	MATH
FRESNO UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT	31%	22%
CHARTERS		
SEAT BASED		
Aspen Public (K-3)	NA	NA
Aspen Valley Prep(K-8)	35.2%	31.9%
Edison-Bethune(K-6)	32.1%	32.6%
Kepler(TK-8)	29.6%	17.9%
Morris E. Dailey(K-5)	84.8%	77.0%
Big Picture(K-12)	18.3%	6.1%
University High(9-12)	100.0%	81.5%
W.E. B. DuBois(K-12)	15.8%	10.2%
INDEPENDENT STUDY + BLENDS		
Ambassador Phillip Sanchez(9-12)	15.5%	0.0%
Carter Woodson (7-12)	15.7%	2.0%
Crescent View South(9-12)	18.9%	2.5%
Crescent View West(7-12)	14.0%	1.0%
School of Unlimited Learning (SOUL)	15.9%	2.3%
Sierra	35.8%	8.5%
West Park(9-12)	20.3%	4.6%
VIRTUAL		
Compass Charter Schools of Fresno	49.1%	18.5%
California Virtual Academy	30.8%	18.3%
includes high school grades 912		

#### **Seat based programs**

- ELA and math scores at Dailey elementary and University high far exceeded the district percentages. At Dailey, 84.8% of students met or exceeded the standards in ELA and 77% did in math. At University High, it was 100% in ELA and 81.5% in math.
- Other than Dailey and University high, relatively high scorers in both ELA and math were Aspen Valley Prep at 35.2% and 31.9% respectively and Edison Bethune (a K-6 program) at 32.1%, and 32.6%
- The low scorers in both tests were Big Picture at 18.3% ELA and 6.1% math and DuBois at 15.8% and 10.2%.
- The average levels for the seat-based programs (excluding the outliers University High and Dailey) were considerably higher than the scores for the independent study and blended programs, but lower than the district.

#### **Independent Study, Blends and Virtual Schools**

- The proportion of students who met or exceeded ELA standards in the independent study charters ranged from 14% at Crescent View West (16% below the district proportion) to 35.8% at Sierra (nearly 5% above the district).
- The average ELA value for this group of charters was 19.44%, below the district and the seat-based charter programs.
- The proportion who met or exceeded standards in math ranged from a low of 0% at Ambassador Phillip Sanchez to a high of 8.5% at Sierra. The average independent study school proportion was 3.3%, far below the district and seat-based program proportions.
- The two combination programs had relatively low ELA and math results, with ELA achievement around 16% at both and math achievement between 2% and 3%.
- The Virtual schools had ELA proficiencies at 49.1% for the Compass affiliate (a major improvement from the previous year for its small high school enrollment) and 30.8% at California Virtual Academy. Math achievement was lower than ELA levels-- as in the other charters and the district-- at 13% and 18.3%, well below the district and the local seat- based charter schools, but above the independent study school results.

Excluding the University High outlier, the average 11<sup>th</sup> grade test proficiencies for charter schools that include grades 9-12 were very much lower than the school districts' levels. All but one of these schools that serve high school students are independent-study or blended programs.

#### **2016-2017 PROFICIENCY AVERAGES**

	ELA averages	MATH averages
CHARTER SCHOOL		
Seat-based*	26.20%	19.74%
Independent study & blends	19.40%	4.40%
FRESNO UNIFIED	33.60%	24.14%
HIGH SCHOOL 11TH GRADE TEST		
CHARTER HIGH SCHOOLS*	21.28%	2.37%
FRESNO UNIFIED	45.23%	15.78%
*excludes Dailey and University High		

#### **SUCCESS MARKERS**

Analysis of dropout and graduation rates at the charter schools is complicated by the fact that most of the charters serving high school grades in Fresno are independent study programs serving a fluid population of students who might not even be in school without the independent study option that these schools provide. These schools serve students who have had academic or discipline problems in their regular schools or have children or other family and work obligations which have made the regular school program difficult. One independent study program administrator stated that any graduate of their program was a graduate that probably would not have happened. Fresno Unified's cohort graduation rate of 85.5% and dropout rate of 10.7% may therefore be an inappropriate comparison. Once there is data, the new FUSD on-line school may provide better comparison figures.

2016-2017 Graduation Rate and Drop-Out Percentages

SCHOOL	GRADUATION %	DROP OUT %
FRESNO UNIFIED	84.3%	10.3%
CHARTERS		
SEAT-BASED		
Big Picture	66.7%	20.8%
University High	88.5%	3.8%
W.E.B. DuBois	15.9%	36.2%
INDEPENDENT STUDY		
Amb. Phillip Sanchez	17.1%	38.9%
Crescent View South	26.9%	38.6%
Crescent View West	21.1%	45.1%
Sierra	56.8%	21.0%
West Park	63.7%	20.9%
BLEND		
Carter Woodson	35.3%	30.2%
SOUL	43.4%	26.5%
VIRTUAL/INDEPENDENT		
Compass Fresno	13.30%	40.00%
CDE Data Quest 4 yr. cohort outcome		

#### **Drop Out Rate:**

- Three seat-based schools in Fresno provide a high school program: Big Picture, DuBois and University High (a high achieving outlier where the dropout rate is 3.8%). Big Picture and DuBois have dropout rates of 20.8% and 36.2% respectively.
- The dropout rate for the independent study schools ranged from a low of 20.9% at West Park to a high of 45.1% at Crescent View West with a mean of 32.9%
- The Compass affiliated virtual school serving just about 40 high school aged students in Fresno had a dropout rate of 40%.
- The schools with combination seat-based and independent study programs, Carter Woodson and SOUL, had dropout rates in line with the other charters at 30.2% and 26.5% respectively.

#### **Graduation Rate**

- The seat-based graduation rates varied. At University high it was 88.5%; Big Picture 66.7% and DuBois just 15.9%. The much lower graduation rate at DuBois was associated with the highest dropout rate of these schools.
- The graduation rate at the independent study schools ranged from lows of 17.1% at Ambassador Sanchez, to a high of 63.7% at West Park. West Park and Sierra had substantially higher graduation rates than the three Learn4Life schools.
- The combination programs at Woodson and SOUL had graduation rates in line with the other independent study charters at 35.3% and 43.4% respectively.
- The Compass affiliated small virtual school in Fresno had the lowest graduation rate of all the charters at 13.3%. This was coupled with the second highest dropout rate.

#### **FINANCES:**

Charter schools are funded on the same basis as school districts, the Local Control Funding Formula (LCFF). The LCFF provides base grants based on specific grade level spans and the actual attendance of students (average daily attendance (ADA)). In addition, schools are provided supplemental funds based on their percentages of high need, "at-risk" students (poverty, foster youth, homeless and English Learners) and the ADA generated by those students. These additional funds are called Supplemental/Concentration grants. While the State does require a test to determine if independent study programs will be funded at a lower level, currently, the independent study and virtual schools reviewed in this report are funded at the same levels as seat-based and district schools.

Because of its high numbers of high need students, Fresno Unified received state funding that equated to \$10,680 per ADA in 2016-2017, including \$7,988 in base funding. Charter funding per ADA ranged from a low of \$8,241 to a high of \$12,012, most accounted for in differences in supplemental funds based on their lower counts of high need students. All schools appear to be financially stable.

- The lowest funded schools were generally elementary schools and/or had the lowest unduplicated count of high need students: Dailey, Kepler, the two virtual schools, and University High received funding from \$1,332 more than Fresno Unified to \$2,439 per ADA less than Fresno Unified.
- The schools with the highest funding were Ambassador Sanchez, an independent study program and SOUL, which offers a blended seat/independent study program. Their ADA funding exceeded F.U.S.D. by about \$1,100 to \$1,300 per student. Carter Woodson, a blend of seat-based and independent study, serves a very much higher percentage of "at-risk" students than the district and has higher funding per ADA. Crescent View West serves an at-risk population that is approximately equivalent to F.U.S.D., while Crescent View South has a lower percentage: both these independent study programs are funded at higher levels per ADA than the district at least in part because secondary grades are funded at higher levels than the elementary grades.
- All the charter schools have been audited and no major findings noted. While three schools were deficit
  spending that year –Aspen, Carter-Woodson, and West Park—all the schools ended the 2016-2017
  school year with positive ending balances.

<b>Local Control Funding Formula Funding</b>	Snapshot						
		Unduplicated Count % (At-Risk	Supplemental	Ras	se plus		tal Diff
Local Educational Agency	Total ADA	Students)	/Concentration		d Ons	Total	USD
Ambassador Phillip V. Sanchez Public	492	91.41%	3,211	\$	8,801	\$ 12,012	\$ 1,332
School of Unlimited Learning (SOUL)	174	93.75%	3,112	\$	8,801	\$ 11,913	\$ 1,233
Carter G. Woodson Public Charter	308	98.43%	3,157	\$	8,699	\$ 11,856	\$ 1,176
Crescent View West Charter	1,053	90.07%	3,102	\$	8,726	\$ 11,828	\$ 1,148
Crescent View South Charter	830	82.39%	2,646	\$	8,771	\$ 11,417	\$ 737
W. E. B. DuBois	340	99.30%	3,066	\$	8,161	\$ 11,226	\$ 546
West Park	237	86.14%	2,763	\$	8,423	\$ 11,186	\$ 506
Fresno Unified	66,841	88.22%	2,692	\$	7,988	\$ 10,680	
Sierra Charter	403	77.94%	2,253	\$	8,328	\$ 10,581	\$ (99)
Aspen Public	77	93.24%	2,757	\$	7,820	\$ 10,577	\$ (103)
Edison-Bethune Charter Academy	546	94.23%	2,677	\$	7,550	\$ 10,227	\$ (453)
Big Picture Educational Academy	445	68.06%	1,627	\$	8,080	\$ 9,707	\$ (973)
Aspen Valley Preparatory Academy	344	78.89%	2,090	\$	7,538	\$ 9,628	\$ (1,052)
University High	465	10.47%	184	\$	8,801	\$ 8,985	\$ (1,695)
California Virtual Academy @ Fresno	383	67.67%	1,486	\$	7,478	\$ 8,963	\$ (1,717)
Compass Charter of Fresno	75	53.60%	848	\$	7,913	\$ 8,761	\$ (1,919)
Kepler	357	58.29%	1,001	\$	7,521	\$ 8,522	\$ (2,158)
Morris E. Dailey	373	37.47%	575	\$	7,667	\$ 8,241	\$ (2,439)
Source: CDE 2016-17 LCFF Snapshot Data							
http://ias.cde.ca.gov/lcffsnapshot/lcff.aspx							

#### **Expense Comparison Analysis**

Utilizing the Ed- Data website and the 2016/17 Unaudited Actuals reported to California Department of Education, a comparison was done to see how the funds were used at the charter schools compared with Fresno Unified's General Fund. School districts typically spend more than 82% on personnel. In 2016/17, these charter schools average around 60% personnel cost and spent more in contracted services or supplies.

State regulations allow for alternative funding determinations for non-classroom-based schools (80% or more of instructional time occurs away from the school site). Full funding (100% of base and supplemental funds) requires 40% of revenues to be spent on certificated personnel and benefits, 80% spent on instruction or instruction-related activities, and a pupil-teacher ratio of 25 to 1 or equal to the ratio in the largest district in the charter school's county. All Fresno independent-study and blend schools are funded at the 100% level.

2016/17 Unaudited Actual Financials	2016/17 Unaudited Actuals Percentage of Expenses by Major Category								
					Personnel			Capital	
School	Teacher	Other Cert	Classified	Benefits	Total	Supplies	Services	Outlay	Transfers
Ambassador Phillip V. Sanchez Public Charter	17%	13%	12%	16%	58%	4%	34%	1%	3%
Crescent View South Charter	6%	25%	8%	14%	53%	7%	36%	2%	3%
Crescent View West Charter	27%	4%	11%	15%	57%	7%	31%	1%	3%
Morris E. Dailey Charter Elementary	38%	10%	7%	14%	69%	4%	28%	0%	0%
Aspen Public	18%	10%	20%	12%	59%	16%	24%	1%	0%
Big Picture Educational Academy	30%	8%	14%	12%	65%	7%	27%	1%	0%
California Virtual Academy @ Fresno	29%	0%	1%	9%	40%	41%	19%	0%	0%
Carter G. Woodson Public Charter	20%	9%	20%	11%	60%	8%	30%	1%	1%
Compass Charter Schools of Fresno	23%	9%	13%	10%	55%	24%	20%	0%	0%
Edison-Bethune Charter Academy	40%	4%	12%	17%	73%	6%	21%	0%	-1%
Inspire Charter Schools - Central	21%	4%	6%	14%	46%	27%	20%	0%	7%
Kepler Neighborhood	27%	7%	10%	10%	55%	8%	36%	0%	0%
Opportunities For Learning - Fresno	12%	14%	11%	8%	46%	7%	42%	0%	4%
School of Unlimited Learning	22%	11%	15%	14%	62%	4%	34%	0%	0%
Sierra Charter	35%	10%	14%	20%	80%	3%	17%	0%	1%
University High	37%	8%	7%	19%	71%	4%	8%	3%	13%
Valley Preparatory Academy Charter	30%	5%	18%	15%	68%	10%	20%	2%	0%
W. E. B. DuBois Public Charter	23%	9%	17%	12%	61%	9%	29%	0%	1%
West Park Charter School	27%	10%	14%	21%	72%	9%	16%	3%	0%
Fresno Unified (General Fund)	35%	9%	14%	26%	84%	5%	10%	0%	0%

School districts are required to report their teacher salary costs in a state report (J-90). Charter schools do not have this requirement. However, they do report the number of classroom teachers in the October reporting process (CSIS data) and the total teacher salary costs in their financial report at year end. Based on this information the average teacher salary costs were calculated. While there are some discrepancies in the data, the average salary for charter school teachers is lower (approximately \$56,000) than Fresno Unified's (approximately \$75,000). While some could be due to lower teacher experience, at least three of the charter schools have average salaries of \$70,000 or more. See Appendix for the financial basis for this analysis.

#### **TRENDS**

#### Closures

At least twelve charter schools have closed in Fresno County, six within the last five years. Some closed voluntarily. Most did not have their charters renewed at their five-year renewal dates--some for financial, others for academic reasons. The lifespan of these schools varied from two to fifteen years.

Subsequent to the data collection for this report, several other charter school changes occurred. The California Virtual Academy Fresno, which was included in this report, just closed in June 2018. Another of the studied schools, Kepler, was denied a renewal by Fresno Unified in May 2018 based on its academic program and performance. It appealed to the County and was granted a three-year extension with oversight stipulations. Two more schools—Ambassador Phillip Sanchez and Crescent View South-- recently petitioned the state, which allowed them to close and reopen as new schools but at the same addresses and same authorizing districts.

Fresno County Charter Schools Closed Since 2002

CHARTER SCHOOL	AUTHORIZER	DATE OF OPENING	EFFECTIVE DATE OF CLOSURE	YEARS OF OPERATION	LOW & HIGH ENROLLMENT	REASON FOR CLOSING	CDE Comments
Gateway Charter Academy	Fresno Unified	1999/2000	1/16/2002	2	204-1005	Academic	Revoked
Renaissance Charter	Fresno Unified	2000/2001	7/1/2002	2	60-140	Finances & Academic	Closed
One Step Up Charter Academy	West Fresno Elementary	2001/2002	6/30/2005	4	143807		Non- renewal
West Fresno Performing Arts Academy	West Fresno Elementary	2002/2003	6/30/2006	4	2-269		Non- renewal
Kipp Academy	Fresno Unified	2004/05	6/30/2009	5	60338	Finances & Administration	Voluntary Closure
Fresno Prep Academy	Fresno Unified	1999/2000	6/30/2009	10	53-147	Academic	Non- renewal
New Millennium Institute of Education	Fresno Unified	1999/2000	6/30/2013	14	66542	Academic	Non- renewal
Sunset Elementary	Fresno Unified	1999/2000	6/30/2014	15	222-298	Transition to district school	Voluntary Closure
Fresno Academy for Civic/Entrepreneurial Leadership	Fresno Unified	2010/11	3/6/2015	4	50157	Financial	Voluntary Closure
New Spirit Charter Academy	Fresno COE	2012/13	6/30/2016	4	52131	Academic	Non- renewal
Valley Arts and Science Academy	Fresno Unified	2007/2008	6/30/2016	2016 9 225-295		Academic	Voluntary Closure
Opportunities for Learning	Westside Elementary	2013/14	6/30/2017	4	1635	Financial	Voluntary Closure

#### **Openings**

One new school will open in 2018 —Fresno County Office of Education's Career Technical Education Charter High School, a seat-based for students in grades 9 through 12. A second school—California Academy of Sports Science, listed as a combination of seat-based and independent study with the California Department of Education—opened in September of 2017 as a virtual school operating out of Ontario California and serving 36 students in grades K-12.

#### **Resource Centers**

Secondary campuses and resource centers and their affiliations have been particularly difficult to track. The State Department of Education does not list them or provide any separate data about them. Their enrollments are presumably included in the chartered school information. The Learn4Life affiliates in Fresno—Crescent View West and South and Ambassador Sanchez-- have all had resource centers in the past.

Ambassador Sanchez did have a secondary site listed with its own charter number, but that secondary site is now named in online promotional materials as a campus of Crescent View West. A Madera site that was once affiliated with Crescent View West is now aligned online as a Crescent View South location. Crescent View West has taken over a Clovis site that once was a resource center for Crescent View South. Two of the schools involved in the shuffle—Ambassador Sanchez and Crescent View South-- have recently closed and reopened according to the CDE.

#### **Enrollments**

Total charter school enrollment over the last five years (2012/13—2016/17) has shown a growth of 27%, more than 1500 students. Most of that growth occurred in the three Learn4Life independent study schools which have opened satellite campuses, and in Big Picture Academy which has opened a new elementary campus. The seat-based schools have been relatively stable over the period. One of the virtual schools (California Virtual Academy) lost more than two hundred students in 2016-17, but gained many of those back in the 2017-2018 CDE records before it closed in June of 2018.

Charter School	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18*	5-YR change 2012-17	% CHANGE
Ambassador Phillip Sanchez	227	432	572	591	421	No data	194	33.92
Aspe Public (K-3)					74	120	74	
Aspen Valley Prep (K-8)	319	315	358	359	363	391	44	13.79
Big Picture	131	124	124	119	355	322	191	154.03
CA. Virtual Academy	637	627	600	517	414	536	-223	-37.17
Compass Charter Fresno			104	125	118	133	14	13.46
Carter Woodson	345	368	340	329	352	345	7	2.06
Crescent View South	365	567	580	582	681	No data	316	54.48
Crescent View West	299	385	459	396	927	1,518	628	136.82
Edison-Bethune	512	519	551	553	576	580	64	11.62
Kepler		199	241	309	386	465	187	77.59
Morris E. Dailey	371	378	376	348	389	398	18	4.79
SOUL	214	174	211	213	184	155	-30	-14.22
Sierra	624	625	534	453	409	417	-215	-40.26
University High	480	495	486	482	474	489	-6	-1.23
W.E.B.Dubois	402	431	372	413	353	373	-49	-13.17
West Park	337	284	298	248	262	267	-75	-25.17
Total enrollment	5582	6238	6564	6396	7101	6900	1519	27.21
FUSD	73689	73353	73543	73460	73356	73455	-333	-0.45

#### **ISSUES OF CONCERN**

Our study of the charter schools in Fresno found that many employ dedicated teachers and staff who are committed to their students and schools as alternatives for some populations. Though they were hand-picked by the charter administrators, the students we spoke with were also very positive about their schools and their educational experiences there. Nonetheless, we have some concerns that can be categorized as related to transparency and accountability, finances, academic achievement, and regulations.

#### **Transparency and Accountability**

So much information about charter schools and their operation is difficult to acquire, if it is available. Charter schools are not subject to the provisions of the Brown Act.

- The virtual schools do not maintain local websites. The general website for the Compass network does contain information about the Fresno site budget and the Local Control Funding Formula Accountability Plan though the site links are not immediately obvious. Board meetings occur in Thousand Oaks and their agendas are published.
- Among the independent-learning sites and blended programs, only one lists board meeting times and agendas (West Park) and only one (Carter-Woodson, a blended program) provides LCAP information.
- The seat-based programs have more complete websites and all provide their board agendas. Only two do not provide LCAP information (the Aspen and Big Picture schools).
- Some data is not readily available from the schools or the state. Ed-Data does not post financial information, and what is posted on the CDE site does not distinguish instruction-related expenditures. Number of full time equivalent (FTE) teachers employed by the charter schools (for purposes of assessing pupil-teacher ratios) is not available data.
- The State has a separate process for the independent study schools to document their instructional expenditures and teacher ratios to determine how they will be funded. This process is not transparent nor consistent with other school reports.
- The existence, location and chartering authority of resource center sites is mysterious.
   Independent-study charter schools that operate within the boundaries of FUSD but are not chartered by the district have established additional sites, drawing more students from the local district boundaries without being accountable to the district. The state does not track anything about these resource centers. All their information is presumed to be included in the data of the main campus.

#### **Finances**

Financial data about the charter schools is not readily available, but what there is suggests some questions about Fresno charter schools and the state's oversight, especially of the independent-study and virtual schools

- The state can fund independent-study programs at 70%, 85%-100%, or not at all. To receive 100% funding, charter schools must show that 40% of their public funds are spent on certificated staff and their benefits, 80% is spent on instructional related activities and that the school maintains a pupil-teacher ratio of 25 to 1 or the ratio of the largest school district where the charter school serves.
- The independent-study schools do not document their instructional expenditures or their teacher ratios yet they are fully funded by the state, including augmented funds based on services to their high need students.
- Attendance, which is the basis for public school funding, is documented in the independent-study charters on the basis of work completed or attempted. If in a five- day contract period, the student signs her name on each day, but does not finish the work, the school records 5 daysworth of attendance. (www.cde.ca.gov/sp/cs/as/csncbadaltr04.asp.) The determination of a "day's work" is a judgment that is quite different from actual time spent in a school seat. Test scores and graduation rates do not suggest that the "attendance" necessarily equates to educational progress.

#### **Achievement**

In all the schools we visited, students expressed appreciation for their education in those schools. While test scores, graduation and dropout rates do not reflect the whole experience of a school, in general outstanding achievement is not what distinguishes these alternatives from the regular public schools in the district.

- Most of the Fresno charter schools serving high school-aged students provide an independent-study experience. While these schools primarily serve students who have had difficulty in main-stream high schools (a description provided by the schools themselves) and many of those students are transfers with few high school credits, by any measure the achievement scores are low, graduation rates are poor (a mean of 37.1%) and the dropout rates are high (a mean of 33.2%). While the schools contend that any graduate is a success story that would not have happened, the success rates are low.
- Except for University High and Dailey Elementary (where students are the least like the demographic profile of the district), the achievement scores of the charter schools are generally low. Some are equal or are higher than the district's overall levels of proficiency in English Language Arts (ELA) or math, but none evidence exceptional success in advancing achievement. The seat-based programs have higher scores than the independent study schools.
- The amount of time spent in direct contact with students in independent-study schools is very low—
  several hours once or twice a week in most. The amount of time spent in home study time is subjectively
  documented and may not be sufficient to compensate for direct instruction given the achievement
  levels of these schools.
- In some charter schools there is a standards-based curriculum in place. In others the content may not address the demands of standardized tests.

#### **Regulations**

Education Code stipulations regarding standards for authorization and reauthorization of charter schools are either vague or disregarded.

- After an evaluation apparently following state standards, Fresno Unified denied the renewal petition of Kepler Charter School, yet the County determined to grant a conditional three-year renewal while accepting the findings of Fresno Unified.
- While many charter schools have closed their doors in Fresno, authorization denials by Fresno Unified have led to subsequent chartering by other districts or the county.

All Ed Code regulations with respect to the establishment of charter schools outside the boundaries of the chartering district are complicated and apparently not enforced. California Ed code 47605(5) specifies that a charter school may establish "one site outside the boundaries of the school district, but within the county in which the school district is located. . . Commencing January 1, 2003, a petition to establish a charter school may not be approved to serve pupils in a grade level that is not served by the school district of the governing board considering the petition, unless the petition proposes to serve pupils in all of the grade levels served by that school district."

- West Park Elementary and Raisin City Elementary Districts do not serve high school students except in charter schools they authorize. Their Fresno charters were originally authorized after 2003 and were reauthorized in 2017.
- It is curious that very small elementary school districts are the authorizers of large high school charters outside their boundaries. Westside Elementary in 2016-2017 sponsored three high school charters—two in Fresno (one closed in 2017) and one in the Central Unified School District. Its own student population numbered 221 in its one elementary school that year. Crescent View Charter itself had 681 students. Adding the other two charters brought Westside's enrollment to 1,181. Raisin City Elementary School District has a student population of 272 in its one elementary school. The addition of Ambassador Sanchez charter in Fresno more than doubles its enrollment figures. It authorized and reauthorized Ambassador Sanchez in Fresno after 2003.
- Their location suggests that the vast majority of students served by Ambassador Sanchez and Crescent
  View South live within the boundaries of Fresno Unified, but the district has no authority to monitor the
  operation of the schools that serve those students. The monitoring districts have very small staffs and
  have no students in the charter schools they oversee.

According to California Education Code 47605.1 (c), a charter school may establish a resource center. That provision is apparently separate from the provision that allows a district to establish "one site outside the boundaries of the school district, but within the county within which that school district is located." (the provision in 47605.1(d))

Recent shuffling of the resource centers of Crescent View West, South and Ambassador Sanchez still
leaves Crescent View South, which is chartered by Westside Elementary, with an apparent resource
center in Madera County. Before this year, Ambassador Sanchez operated two sites, one in Fresno
and one just beyond the boundary of Fresno Unified in the Clovis Unified School District area, and
Crescent View South also operated one in Clovis.

There does not appear to be sufficient regulation of virtual charters to match their level of activity in the state. While Fresno currently has just one with a Fresno charter location (California Virtual Charter closed in June 2018 although it is still listed as open on some CDE sites), there is a notable level of local advertising for "personalized" learning by virtual education providers.

- The two local virtual schools were both authorized by Orange Center Elementary District, another very small district (301 students in 2016-2017). With the addition of the two virtual schools operating in Fresno, it lists a total enrollment at 669. It is of interest whether one school elementary districts like Orange Center have the staff to effectively manage their oversight responsibilities.
- Virtual charter school data on the Ed-Data website displays total FTE for all sites regardless of the charter authorizer. This number does not correlate with the Unaudited Actuals information nor does it provide information on the local site services.
- One-hundred percent base-level funding plus all LCFF funds appropriate for the high need students
  included in their enrollments mean considerable public money (though less per ADA than Fresno
  Unified) flowing to these virtual schools. They are afforded 100% funding even though we found no
  justifying information to support that level. Ed-Data on teaching staff FTE is unreliable, funds spent
  on instruction related activities is apparently not collected, and average daily attendance suffers
  from much the same subjective evaluation as for the independent study schools.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- Charter schools should be more transparent and provide at least the following information on their websites to inform their staff, parents, students and community: their LCAP plan, external financial audits, state financial reports prepared for their Board, and clear and concise student achievement data.
- 2) Charter boards should voluntarily follow the Brown Act and list board meeting agendas, supporting information, and minutes of each board meeting on the school website.
- 3) Charter schools should list all the locations of their school sites including resource centers and notify the state and resident district of the opening of any new sites.
- 4) Independent-study schools and their chartering districts need to review the curricula that are in place and develop ways to strengthen them to motivate students to gain more knowledge, stay in school, and graduate. They may need to more directly address the state content standards and adjust teacher contact time based on student progress.
- 5) California standards for governing the granting of charters, their renewal and their funding ought to be evaluated, amended and enforced as necessary to ensure that charter schools can be expected to meet their stated goals.
  - Standards for overturning a charter determination by the district housing a charter school should be strict, specific and enforced.
  - Rules governing resource centers need to be enforced.

- Information about resource centers needs to be collected by the state, including their location, enrollments, and staffing.
- School districts and county offices should be well trained in authorization and oversight responsibilities and standards.
- The chartering of schools outside an authorizer's boundaries ought to be subject to particular scrutiny.
- 6) The state should provide financial data for each charter school on the Ed-Data website. Currently charter school data is not readily available, especially that data that justifies 100% funding levels. We recommend the charter schools be required to utilize the State Standardize Account Code Structure to ensure consistency of the information.
- 7) Virtual school teacher information on the Ed-Data website needs to distinguish the charters with different authorizing districts.
- 8) The state needs to evaluate the calculation of attendance for independent-study and virtual schools and align them with school district standards to be sure that the students are receiving the value of the state's investment.
- 9) The high achieving charter schools in Fresno should increase their outreach efforts to attract a more diverse and representative number of applicants who would benefit from their programs.

#### APPENDIX I; Financial data

#### 2016/17 Unaudited Actual Financials

	Teacher	Other Cert	Classified				Capital		
School	Salaries	Salaries	Salaries	Benefits	Supplies	Service	Outlay	Transfers	Total Expenses
Ambassador Phillip V. Sanchez Public Charter	\$ 1,017,212	\$ 775,093	\$ 699,271	\$ 949,370	\$ 253,533	\$ 2,047,970	\$ 64,686	\$ 151,545	\$ 5,958,681
Aspen Public	263,071	146,646	292,570	180,470	235,113	358,868	20,744	1,108	\$ 1,498,590
Aspen Valley Preparatory Academy Charter	1,250,253	229,727	747,508	614,036	423,892	854,570	68,724	15,060	\$ 4,203,770
Big Picture Educational Academy	1,341,217	362,583	633,401	544,177	323,915	1,196,437	31,237	63	\$ 4,433,029
California Virtual Academy @ Fresno	1,137,027		39,529	358,754	1,604,961	731,041	12,366	-	\$ 3,883,678
Carter G. Woodson Public Charter	927,719	414,947	917,717	480,666	366,875	1,384,155	29,895	37,340	\$ 4,559,314
Compass Charter Schools of Fresno	281,955	111,242	161,146	120,107	296,197	247,149	-	-	\$ 1,217,796
Crescent View South Charter	605,293	2,399,707	727,337	1,287,015	688,914	3,389,279	191,546	244,132	\$ 9,533,223
Crescent View West Charter	3,260,194	470,357	1,376,703	1,792,477	883,496	3,701,817	173,022	353,903	\$ 12,011,969
Edison-Bethune Charter Academy	1,987,005	219,801	600,909	837,490	296,231	1,062,528	10,560	(41,971)	\$ 4,972,552
Kepler Neighborhood	951,609	250,446	355,359	357,346	293,893	1,258,279	14,143	251	\$ 3,481,326
Morris E. Dailey Charter Elementary	1,117,715	300,500	199,830	407,447	105,218	813,743	-	-	\$ 2,944,453
School of Unlimited Learning	512,880	267,067	348,604	327,746	91,352	801,215	-	-	\$ 2,348,863
Sierra Charter	1,641,155	480,964	670,088	928,786	128,539	779,259	-	38,923	\$ 4,667,714
University High	1,768,414	371,936	319,913	910,459	210,224	397,488	127,171	625,612	\$ 4,731,217
W. E. B. DuBois Public Charter	1,010,893	388,879	768,901	538,851	393,608	1,260,955	12,779	39,082	\$ 4,413,948
West Park Charter School	805,247	307,999	420,060	606,903	260,335	476,618	80,192	-	\$ 2,957,355
Fresno Unified (General Fund)	284,193,441	72,912,346	113,871,995	209,941,329	44,244,869	83,922,706	2,965,645	860,156	\$ 812,912,487

#### 2016/17 Average Teacher Salary/Teacher Full Time Equivalent (FTE)

			Average	
aha al			eacher	Toochou FTF
School		alary (1)	Teacher FTE	
Ambassador Phillip V. Sanchez Public Charter	\$	48,439	21	
Aspen Public		\$	43,845	6
Aspen Valley Preparatory Academy Charter	\$	54,359	23	
Big Picture Educational Academy		\$	53,649	25
California Virtual Academy @ Fresno (	3)	\$	55,737	20
Carter G. Woodson Public Charter		\$	51,540	18
Compass Charter Schools of Fresno (	3)	\$	16,586	17
Crescent View South Charter	(4)	\$	17,294	35
Crescent View West Charter	(4)	\$	72,449	45
Edison-Bethune Charter Academy		\$	70,964	28
Kepler Neighborhood		\$	47,580	20
Morris E. Dailey Charter Elementary		\$	79,837	14
School of Unlimited Learning (S.O.U.L.)		\$	51,288	10
Sierra Charter		\$	58,613	28
University High		\$	84,210	21
W. E. B. DuBois Public Charter		\$	59,464	17
West Park Charter School		\$	53,683	15
Fresno Unified (General Fund) (2)		\$	74,719	3,693

- 1. Average Teacher Salary utilizes Classroom Teacher FTE from Ed-Data website and 2016/17 Unaudited Actual Teacher Salaries. Avg salary overstated for teacher salaries include substitute salaries and teacher supplemental contracts.
- 2. FUSD Average Teacher Salary and Teacher FTE is from the 2016/17 J-90 report. This is before FUSD settled. So salary/benefit costs would be approximately 3.5% higher if they had settled by year-end (\$77,334).
- 3. FTE reported in Ed-Data misleading. FTE as reported by charter school per League's request.
- 4. FTE shown is from Ed-Data website which utilizes CBEDS data. Data does not look correct. We have not received a response from the charter school.